Deep Dive – Social Accountability

Social Accountability

A set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.

**TYPES**

- **DEMOCRATIC ACCOUNTABILITY**
  - Systems, laws, and contexts that build an environment for citizen-led accountability

- **PERFORMANCE ACCOUNTABILITY**
  - Citizens and civil society organizations hold government actors and service providers accountable

- **FINANCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY**
  - Citizens and civil society organizations monitor and track public budget management and potential leakage of funds

**NECESSARY COMPONENTS**

- **SYSTEM-DRIVEN**
  - **TRANSPARENCY OF DATA**
    - Disclosure of relevant health indicators, budget allocation and expenditure reports, and performance indicators for monitoring
  - **TOP-DOWN RESPONSIVENESS**
    - Government institutions and actors are open to and responsive to citizen voice and feedback

- **USER-DRIVEN**
  - **REPRESENTATIVE PARTICIPATION**
    - Participation of an inclusive sample of the users of a health system in social accountability activities
  - **CITIZEN-LED OVERSIGHT**
    - Citizen- or civil society-led interventions to conduct health system monitoring

**IMPROVE HEALTH SYSTEM PERFORMANCE**
Social Accountability is a component of Governance & Leadership

System
- Governance & Leadership
  - Primary Health Care Policies
  - Quality Management Infrastructure
  - Social Accountability
- Health Financing
  - Payment Systems
  - Spending on Primary Health Care
  - Financial Coverage
- Adjustment to Population Health Needs
  - Surveillance
  - Priority Setting
  - Innovation & Learning

Inputs
- Drugs & Supplies
- Facility Infrastructure
- Information Systems
- Workforce
- Funds

Service Delivery
- Population Health Management
  - Local Priority Setting
  - Community Engagement
  - Empanelment
  - Proactive Population Outreach
- Facility Organization & Management
  - Team-based Care Organization
  - Facility Management Capability & Leadership
  - Information Systems Use
  - Performance Measurement & Management Outreach
- Access
  - Financial
  - Geographic
  - Timeliness
- Availability of Effective Primary Health Care Services
  - Provider Availability
  - Provider Competence
  - Provider Motivation
  - Patient-provider Respect & Trust
  - Safety
- High Quality Primary Health Care
  - First Contact Accessibility
  - Continuity
  - Comprehensiveness
  - Coordination
  - Person-centered

Outputs
- Effective Service Coverage
  - Health Promotion
  - Disease Prevention
  - RMNCH
  - Childhood Illness
  - Infectious Disease
  - NCDs & Mental Health
  - Palliative Care

Outcomes
- Health Status
- Responsiveness to People
- Equity
- Efficiency
- Resilience of Health Systems

Social Determinants & Context (Political, Social, Demographic & Socioeconomic)
Social Accountability is a component of Adjustment to Governance & Leadership

Governance & Leadership
- Primary Health Care Policies
- Quality Management Infrastructure
- Social Accountability

Primary Health Care Policies

Quality Management Infrastructure

Social Accountability
What can you learn about Social Accountability from the Improvement Strategies?

SECTION 1
What is Social Accountability?

What it is: Learn more about the core principles and goals of Social Accountability and its role in PHC improvement.

SECTION 2
How do I assess my performance?

What it is: Learn more about some indications that improvements might be relevant in your context and what you can achieve by focusing improvements on Social Accountability.

Vital Signs Profile: Use the information in your Vital Signs Profile to help determine relevant areas for improvement.

SECTION 3
How do I get started?

What others have done: Learn from implementation approaches and challenges in other country contexts.

How to succeed: Consider your country context, what elements are not functioning properly, and what needs to be in place to support effective improvements.

What to ask: Use guiding questions to help determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your country context.

Guided by the above considerations and relevant resources, start to build out an improvement plan with your CE lead and/or focal point.
What can my country achieve by focusing on Social Accountability?

Goals & Outcomes

✓ **Ensure** governments and leaders are held accountable for the content of policies and delivery of health services to improve system performance, and responsiveness to public needs
Social Accountability

How do I assess my performance?

Learn more about whether you should focus on Social Accountability in the Vital Signs Profile.
How do I assess my performance?

Use the information in the **Vital Signs Profile** to help determine relevant **areas of improvement**.
How do I assess my performance?

Use the information in the Vital Signs Profile to help determine relevant areas of improvement.
How do I assess my performance?

Use the information in the Vital Signs Profile to help determine relevant areas of improvement.
What are indications that Social Accountability might be an appropriate area of focus?

Other Indications

☐ **Limited or no involvement** of the private sector, civil society and/or NGOs in health care planning, policy formation, and monitoring and evaluation

☐ **Insufficient top-down responsiveness** from government institutions and actors to feedback and public oversight

☐ **Lack of public disclosure** on the status of PHC implementation and results
Learn more about the core principles of Social Accountability and what you can achieve by focusing improvements in the **What it is** section.
What is Social Accountability?

Social Accountability is a measure of whether a country is held accountable to existing and emerging social concerns and priorities based on needs relevant to PHC of internal and external stakeholders.

Social accountability offers a set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.
What is Social Accountability?

Social Accountability is a measure of whether a country is held accountable to existing and emerging social concerns and priorities based on needs relevant to PHC of internal and external stakeholders.

Social accountability offers a set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.

Why it’s important

- **Ensures coordination** between two key sets of actors: those with decision-making power, and citizens or civil society.
- **Improves health systems performance** through bottom-up monitoring and proactive engagement.
- **Holds governments and service providers accountable** to communities’ social needs and priorities.
What is Social Accountability?

**Social Accountability** is a measure of whether a country is held accountable to existing and emerging social concerns and priorities based on needs relevant to PHC of internal and external stakeholders.

Social accountability offers a set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.

### Key components

- **Information transparency**
  Assist in monitoring the health system, including disclosure of relevant health indicators, budget allocation and expenditure reports, and health system performance indicators.

- **Responsiveness to people**
  Ensure government institutions and actors are open and responsive to citizen voice and feedback.

- **Representative participation**
  Ensure that the voice emerging from the community are heard and included in social accountability activities.

- **Citizen-led oversight**
  Conduct health systems monitoring through citizen-or civil society-led interventions.
**Social Accountability**

A set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.

**Types**

- **Democratic Accountability**: Systems, laws, and contexts that build an environment for citizen-led accountability.
- **Performance Accountability**: Citizens and civil society organizations hold government actors and service providers accountable.
- **Financial Accountability**: Citizens and civil society organizations monitor and track public budget management and potential leakage of funds.

**System-driven**

- **Transparency of Data**: Disclosure of relevant health indicators, budget allocation and expenditure reports, and performance indicators for monitoring.
- **Top-down Responsiveness**: Government institutions and actors are open to and responsive to citizen voice and feedback.

**User-driven**

- **Representative Participation**: Participation of an inclusive sample of the users of a health system in social accountability activities.
- **Citizen-led Oversight**: Citizen- or civil society-led interventions to conduct health system monitoring.

**Necessary Components**

**Improve Health System Performance**
Deeper dive: Forms of social accountability

Socially accountable initiatives generally fall into one of the following three categories:

**Democratic accountability:** Systems, laws, and contexts that build an enabling environment for citizen-led accountability. To strengthen PHC, democratic accountability includes initiatives by governments to open space for citizen monitoring of the health system and often include a combination of transparency and responsiveness efforts.

**Performance accountability:** Initiatives and actions by citizens and civil society organizations (CSOs) to hold government actors and service providers accountable for their performance through bottom-up monitoring and engagement. This includes participation of community members and mechanisms to hold administrators and policy makers accountable to the needs of the people.

**Financial accountability:** Initiatives and actions by citizens and CSOs to track leakage and mismanagement of public budgets and expenditure within the health system. In practice, this process is quite like performance accountability with a different set of outcomes, namely monitoring of expenditure of funds for services.
Social Accountability – How do I get started?

Derive information from **What others have done**, **What to ask** and **How to succeed** to help determine where and how you might begin to plan and enact forms in your country context.
Planning for improvement in your context

The guidance and recommendations described within the Social Accountability module are not intended to provide a one-size-fits all solution.

The considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

Sample activities

- **Consider** implementation challenges and approaches in other country contexts

- **Understand how the features of your health system**, such as how decisions get made and the role of the private sector, will impact your improvement plans

- **Identify** key elements that need to be in place to support improvements

- **Use the guiding questions in the Improvement Strategies** to spur thinking about [Module] in your country context and stimulate ideas for improvement

- **Start to develop** an improvement plan
While the **specific considerations** involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your context, you might consider...

**What are some factors that impact effective social accountability?**

- Quality data
- Information systems
- Community engagement
- Cost of interventions
- PHC policy and legal enforcement mechanisms
Learn from what others have done

Citizen Participation and Health Outcomes | Brazil
Linking participatory budgeting to a decrease in infant mortality

Civil Society-Led Monitoring | Nigeria
Increasing open contracting in primary health care
Brazil: At-a-glance context

- Latin America & Caribbean
- Upper-Middle Income
- Portuguese-speaking country
## Brazil: At-a-glance context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GDP per capita ($PPP)</th>
<th>Human Development Index</th>
<th>Life expectancy at birth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$15.5K</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of population living in rural areas</th>
<th>Percentage of population living under $1.90 per day</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>209.3M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Learn from what others have done: Brazil

Background & Approach

• Brazil is one country that has used participatory budgeting as a means for improving primary health care outcomes

• By giving community members the power to decide where a portion of the budget is spent, participatory budgeting is a democratic process that engages citizens in the process of improving local health outcomes

Impact

In Brazil, budgeting trends shifted within municipalities with a larger share of budgets being allocated to health and sanitation

An assessment of participatory budgeting from 1990 to 2004 shows increased participation by citizens over time as well as participation becoming increasingly representative over time

Learn from what others have done: Brazil

- **Involves** community participation in primary health care improvement
- **Builds** community feedback directly into the budgeting process
- **Strengthens** information flows between policy-makers and citizens
- **Improves** primary health care outcomes in the community
Nigeria: At-a-glance context

- Sub-Saharan Africa
- Lower-Middle Income
- Multiple languages
Nigeria: At-a-glance context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GDP per capita ($PPP)</th>
<th>Human Development Index</th>
<th>Life expectancy at birth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$5,861</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of population living in rural areas</th>
<th>Percentage of population living under $1.90 per day</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>190.9M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Background & Approach

• In 2014, a CSO in Nigeria implemented a financial accountability initiative to improve health system outcomes through strengthened infrastructure

• The Public Private Development Centre (PPDC) tracked expenditures for procurement in the construction of 40 PHC Centers by the Nigerian Primary Health Care Development Agency.

Rationale

In collaboration with a university, procurement specialists, and a newspaper, PPDC discovered that only 36 percent of expenditures that were set aside to build new facilities resulted in operational facilities

The initiative found that the government construction of PHCs was extremely inefficient and possibly suffered from corruption and collusion.

Learn from what others have done: Nigeria

As a result of PPDCs findings, the Nigerian government in conjunction with the Health Minister announced the following improvements:

• A commitment to the construction of 10,000 new PHCs

• Government pledge to use open contracting in new procurement

• Support for civil society-led monitoring through a grant for PPDC to continue development of the open contracting platform, Budeshi

Outcomes & Impact

Learn from what others have done: Nigeria

Strengths

- **Transparency and accessibility**: The process led to greater visibility of government processes and an increase in data accessible to the public.

- **Oversight**: The CSO led intervention effectively conducted PHC monitoring and oversight.

- **Top-down responsiveness**: Government officials and the ministry of health responded to the results of the investigation with tangible steps towards improvement.
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Social Accountability?
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Social Accountability?

**Community engagement** is a prerequisite to ensuring representative participation. Social accountability offers an overarching methodology to ensure citizen feedback in health systems, and it can only be possible through strong community engagement.
Primary health care policies and quality management infrastructure build a necessary enabling environment for effective social accountability initiatives. For social accountability programs to be effective, civil society needs to have institutional structures, including policies and quality management, to ensure that their feedback regarding problems with the health system and services can be rectified through proper channels.
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Social Accountability?

Effective information systems are key to successful social accountability. Information systems facilitate transparency of the health system and can help bridge the gap in knowledge and participation between citizens and primary health care by making information accessible and understandable.
Questions to ask to help you get started

The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ What systems for social accountability (if any) already exist in the system?
Questions to ask to help you get started

The **specific considerations** involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful **starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms** in your context.

### Sample questions

- What systems for social accountability (if any) already exist in the system?

- Do ongoing initiatives have all four necessary components for success?
The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ What systems for social accountability (if any) already exist in the system?

☐ Do ongoing initiatives have all four necessary components for success?

☐ Who should play a formal role in the social accountability program?
Questions to ask to help you get started

The **specific considerations** involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful **starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms** in your context.

**Sample questions**

- What systems for social accountability (if any) already exist in the system?
- Do ongoing initiatives have all four necessary components for success?
- Who should play a formal role in the social accountability program?
- What are the core problems that communities and civil society care about in primary healthcare that should be the focus of social accountability efforts?
The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ What systems for social accountability (if any) already exist in the system?

☐ Do ongoing initiatives have all four necessary components for success?

☐ Who should play a formal role in the social accountability program?

☐ What are the core problems that communities and civil society care about in primary healthcare that should be the focus of social accountability efforts?

☐ Are there existing institutions that can help to support social accountability?
Recap: Social Accountability

System
- Governance & Leadership
  - Primary Health Care Policies
  - Quality Management Infrastructure
  - Social Accountability
- Health Financing
  - Payment Systems
  - Spending on Primary Health Care
  - Financial Coverage
- Adjustment to Population Health Needs
  - Surveillance
  - Priority Setting
  - Innovation & Learning

Inputs
- Drugs & Supplies
- Facility Infrastructure
- Information Systems
- Workforce
- Funds

Service Delivery
- Population Health Management
  - Local Priority Setting
  - Community Engagement
  - Empowerment
  - Proactive Population Outreach
- Facility Organization & Management
  - Team-based Care Organization
  - Facility Management
  - Capability & Leadership
  - Information Systems Use
  - Performance Measurement & Management Outreach
- Access
  - Financial
  - Geographic
  - Timeliness
- High Quality Primary Health Care
  - First Contact Accessibility
  - Continuity
  - Comprehensiveness
  - Coordination
  - Person-centered
- Availability of Effective PHC Services
  - Provider Availability
  - Provider Competence
  - Provider Motivation
  - Patient-provider
  - Respect & Trust
  - Safety

Outputs
- Effective Service Coverage
  - Health Promotion
  - Disease Prevention
  - RMNCH
  - Childhood Illness
  - Infectious Disease
  - NCDs & Mental Health
  - Palliative Care

Outcomes
- Health Status
- Responsiveness to People
- Equity
- Efficiency
- Resilience of Health Systems

Social Determinants & Context (Political, Social, Demographic & Socioeconomic)
Recap: Social Accountability

Social Accountability

A set of approaches and tools to promote citizen engagement and monitoring to improve system performance, effectiveness, and responsiveness to public needs.

**Healthcare Leadership and Governance Includes...**

**Social Accountability**

**Types**
- **Democratic Accountability**
  - Systems, laws, and contexts that build an environment for citizen-led accountability
- **Performance Accountability**
  - Citizens and civil society organizations hold government actors and service providers accountable
- **Financial Accountability**
  - Citizens and civil society organizations monitor and track public budget management and potential leakage of funds

** Necessary Components**

**System Driven**
- **Transparency of Data**
  - Disclosure of relevant health indicators, budget allocation and expenditure reports, and performance indicators for monitoring
- **Top-Down Responsiveness**
  - Government institutions and actors are open to and responsive to citizen voice and feedback

**User Driven**
- **Representative Participation**
  - Participation of an inclusive sample of the users of a health system in social accountability activities
- **Citizen-Led Oversight**
  - Citizen- or civil society-led interventions to conduct health system monitoring

**Improve Health System Performance**