Deep Dive – Provider Motivation

Provider Motivation

“Motivation in the work context can be defined as an individual’s degree of willingness to exert and maintain an effort towards organizational goals.” Motivation captures intrinsic and extrinsic characteristics that affect the behavior and performance of providers in a health system. Intrinsic motivation is the feeling of accomplishment driven by organizational goals and the impact of one’s work on patients and communities. Alternatively, extrinsic motivation is driven by monetary or non-monetary individual or environmental incentives. Within motivation, the literature has a particular focus on degree of provider autonomy, degree of remunerative motivation, supportive supervision, options for professional development, and level of burnout.

Visual Aid - Availability of Effective PHC

Availability of Effective PHC

Can a patient see a provider when needed?
Provider Motivation is a component of Availability of Effective PHC

Social Determinants & Context (Political, Social, Demographic & Socioeconomic)
Provider Motivation is a component of Availability of Effective PHC

Availability of Effective PHC
- Patient-Provider Respect and Trust
- Provider Availability
- Provider Competence
- Provider Motivation
- Safety

Patient-Provider Respect and Trust

Provider Availability

Provider Competence

Provider Motivation

Safety
What can you learn about Provider Motivation from the Improvement Strategies?

**SECTION 1**

**What is Provider Motivation?**

**What it is:** Learn more about the core principles and goals of Provider Motivation and its role in PHC improvement.

---

**SECTION 2**

**How do I assess my performance?**

**What it is:** Learn more about some indications that improvements might be relevant in your context and what you can achieve by focusing improvements on Provider Motivation.

**Vital Signs Profile:** Use the information in your Vital Signs Profile to help determine relevant areas for improvement.

---

**SECTION 3**

**How do I get started?**

**What others have done:** Learn from implementation approaches and challenges in other country contexts.

**How to succeed:** Consider your country context, what elements are not functioning properly, and what needs to be in place to support effective improvements.

**What to ask:** Use guiding questions to help determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your country context.

*Guided by the above considerations and relevant resources, start to build out an improvement plan with your CE lead and/or focal point.*
What can my country achieve by focusing on Provider Motivation?

Goals & Outcomes

✓ **Improves** behaviors and performance of providers in a health system

✓ **Enhances** patient experience and the availability of person-centered care

✓ May help to **decrease** experiences of provider burnout
Provider Motivation—How do I assess my performance?

Learn more about whether you should focus on Provider Motivation in the Vital Signs Profile.
How do I assess my performance?

Completion of a **Vital Signs Profile** gives countries a holistic understanding of PHC strengths and weaknesses, a critical first step in the measurement for improvement pathway.

Use the information in the **Vital Signs Profile** to help determine relevant areas of improvement.
What are other indications that Provider Motivation might be an appropriate area of focus?

Other Indications

☐ There is no adequate system in place to ensure proper provider compensation

☐ There are not sufficient non-financial provider benefits such as holidays, professional development, and feedback systems

☐ Poor environmental conditions exist such as a lack of transportation options, spousal employment, and schools for children of providers

☐ Poor quality of care from the patient perspective
Provider Motivation - What is it?

Learn more about the core principles of Provider Motivation and what you can achieve by focusing improvements in the What it is section.
What is Provider Motivation?

Provider Motivation captures intrinsic and extrinsic characteristics that affect the behavior and performance of providers in a health system. “Motivation in the work context can be defined as an individual’s degree of willingness to exert and maintain an effort towards organizational goals.”

A motivated workforce is an essential component of effective PHC services.

What is Provider Motivation?

**Provider Motivation** captures intrinsic and extrinsic characteristics that affect the behavior and performance of providers in a health system. “Motivation in the work context can be defined as an individual’s degree of willingness to exert and maintain an effort towards organizational goals.”

A motivated workforce is an **essential component of effective PHC services.**

### Key steps and considerations

1. **Take contextual factors into account**
   Consider a diverse range of financial, environmental, and interpersonal factors in the design of provider motivation-related incentives and interventions.

2. **Measure and assess provider motivation**
   Utilize information systems and tools such as assessments and conversation guides to understand motivation and track provider performance.

3. **Build systems for oversight and leadership**
   Develop strong managerial capacity to plan and implement incentives and interventions at the facility level.
Visual aid: What is Provider Motivation?

Availability of Effective PHC
The level to which providers are available, competent, and motivated to sufficiently address patients’ PHC needs

Can a patient see a provider when needed?

- **Provider Availability**
  - Three components determine availability:
  - **Suitable Workforce**
    - An adequately sized workforce with appropriate skill mix and equitable distribution
  - **Minimal Absenteeism**
    - That workforce is predictably onsite and available to serve patients
  - **Sufficient Time**
    - Each provider has enough time to devote to each patient’s needs

During interactions with providers, do the patients receive appropriate care?

- **Provider Motivation**
  - May be intrinsically or extrinsically driven, and is affected by both availability and competence
  - Fulfillment from work and appreciation of patients
  - Money or work benefits, housing, vacation time, other opportunities

- **Provider Competence**
  - Should be pursued during pre-service training, in-service training, and during standard supervision. Training should be specific to the skills and tasks providers are expected to provide

- **Respectful and Trusting Relationships**
  - Patients and providers should have mutually trusting and respectful relationships that are strengthened over time

- **Knowledge Informs Practice**
  - Providers
  - Instructor
  - Provider
Provider motivation is closely related to both burnout and satisfaction. Burnout typically occurs when providers are overworked and unsatisfied. However, even providers who are experiencing burnout may still be motivated if they are intrinsically committed and passionate about the work they do.

Therefore, motivation is typically considered from two dimensions: extrinsic motivation and intrinsic motivation.
## Deeper dive: Extrinsic and Intrinsic Motivation

### Extrinsic Motivation

Extrinsic motivation is motivation that is incentivized by anything other than personal drive and commitment. It may be related to monetary or non-monetary individual incentives or environmental incentives.

Individual incentives may take on a variety of forms:

- Monetary incentives such as salary, pensions, insurance, and travel
- Non-financial incentives such as vacation days, flexible working hours, training and education
- Environmental incentives such as amenities, transportation, and job for spouse

### Intrinsic Motivation

Intrinsic motivation is the feeling of accomplishment or satisfaction with organizational goals and with the impact of one’s work.

Interventions listed below are typically pursued at the facility or community-level:

- Physical and psychological safety, meaning and purpose, choice and autonomy
- Camaraderie and teamwork
- Daily improvement, wellness and resilience
- Recognition and rewards, participative management, and real-time measurement
Provider Motivation—How do I get started?

Derive information from What others have done, What to ask and How to succeed to help determine where and how you might begin to plan and enact forms in your country context.
Planning for improvement in your context

The guidance and recommendations described within the Provider Motivation module are not intended to provide a one-size-fits all solution.

The considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

Sample activities

- **Consider** implementation challenges and approaches in other country contexts
- **Understand** how the features of your health system, such as how decisions get made and the role of the private sector, will impact your improvement plans
- **Identify** key elements that need to be in place to support improvements
- **Use the guiding questions in the Improvement Strategies** to spur thinking about [Module] in your country context and stimulate ideas for improvement
- **Start to develop** an improvement plan
Planning for improvement in your context

While the **specific considerations** involved in planning and implementing strategies **will depend on your context**, you might consider...

- **Factors that impact provider motivation:**
  - Availability and quality of systems dedicated to improving individual incentives
  - Mutually trusting and respectful patient-provider relationships
  - Provider availability and competence

- **Tools and guides to support provider motivation:**
  - Performance-based financing (PBF)
  - Systematic Community Engagement (SCE)
  - Conversation guides, change ideas, and assessment guides to promote a happy, healthy, productive workforce
Learn from what others have done

Monetary Extrinsic Motivation | Multiple Countries
Performance based financing as a tool to motivate providers

QUALMAT conceptual framework | Multiple Countries
Measuring provider motivation in under resourced settings
Multiple Countries: At-a-glance context

**Thailand**
East Asia & Pacific | Upper-Middle Income
69M | 51% Rural

**Costa Rica**
Latin America & Caribbean | Upper-Middle Income
4.9M | 21% Rural

**Estonia**
Europe & Central Asia | High Income
1.3M | 31% Rural
Learn from what others have done: Thailand, Costa Rica and Estonia

Rationale and approach

• Over the last several decades, a number of countries have integrated performance-based financing (PBF) into existing provider payment mechanisms.

• PBF offers a promising intervention that can motivate health workers and improve quality of care.

• PBF can be integrated into provider payment mechanisms in a variety of ways, and the success of each is contingent upon local context.
## Country-specific approach

**Thailand** implemented PBF for primary care providers using the UK Quality and Outcomes Framework.

- The PBF program is supplemental to capitated payments.
- It is designed to incentivize the provision of health promotion and disease prevention, primary care services, organizational development and management, and services targeted to local needs.

**Costa Rica** instituted a version of PBF, called management commitments.

- In this model, the Costa Rican social security agency – the Coja Costarricense de Seguro Social (CCSS) – and service providers agree to performance indicators and targets on an annual basis.

**Estonia** utilizes a mix of monthly allowances, fee-for-service, and PBF through the Quality Bonus System (QBS).

- In this model, providers earn points based on annually revised indicators related to disease prevention, chronic disease management, and other activities.
Learn from what others have done: Thailand, Costa Rica and Estonia

Strengths

- **Establishes** targets that measure provider outcomes and system improvements rather than activities and performance.
- **Supports** flexible implementation into existing provider payment mechanisms based on local context.
- **Focuses** PBF on provider autonomy and ability to practice person-centered care.
Learn from what others have done: Thailand, Costa Rica and Estonia

What was needed for success

- **Robust capacity and infrastructure**, necessary to measure performance and monitor programs
- **Revision of indicators over time**, in order to support an increase in provider motivation
Multiple Countries: At-a-glance context

**Burkina Faso**
Sub-Saharan Africa | Low Income
19.2M | 71% Rural

**Ghana**
Sub-Saharan Africa | Lower-Middle Income
28.2M | 45% Rural

**Tanzania**
Sub-Saharan Africa | Low Income
57.3M | 67% Rural
Rationale and Approach

• The Quality of Prenatal and Maternal Care: Bridging the Know-Do Gap (QUALMAT) project in Burkina Faso, Ghana, and Tanzania is an intervention designed to improve provider motivation.

• Researchers developed a tool to measure provider motivation through consideration of the QUALMAT conceptual framework, qualitative research, and a literature review.

• The final instrument includes measures related to four areas:
  • Demographics
  • Management
  • Performance
  • Individual factors
Learn from what others have done: Thailand, Costa Rica and Estonia

- **Consistency**: Evaluators compared results across contexts and found that some internal consistency was lost due to the culturally-specific nature of motivation.

- **Investment into the process**: Extensive time must be planned to adapt the instrument to the local context.

What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?

Provider caseload is a significant determinant of motivation and satisfaction. It is important that there is a sufficiently sized workforce to ensure that providers are not overworked and are given enough time to receive in-service training, engage in career development-related activities, and meet with supervisors.
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?

Many contextual factors that determine provider motivation can be addressed at the facility level and are influenced by facility organization and management. Facility leadership should oversee supervision, training, and opportunities for upward mobility, and effective performance measurement and management practices can help identify weaknesses within the current system. Providers should have adequate input into facility flow and support structures to best support their success and improve their motivation.
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?

Receiving compensation in a timely and reliable manner is an important motivational incentive for providers and/or care teams. This process is dependent on the availability of funds and existence of necessary structures to ensure timely compensation.
What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?

Environmental factors and facility inputs are an important determinant of health worker motivation. Providers should be supported by all the tools and infrastructure needed to effectively carry out their expected responsibilities.
Example: What elements should be in place to support effective improvements in Provider Motivation?

**Community engagement** in the form of community oversight of facility activities and community approval and support of providers and their services may be a valuable tool for improving provider motivation. This interaction between patients and providers may encourage stronger relationships and contribute to intrinsic motivation of providers.
The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ If there are performance-based financing mechanisms in place, how were indicators and targets selected? Do they describe activities or outcomes?
The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ If there are performance-based financing mechanisms in place, how were indicators and targets selected? Do they describe activities or outcomes?

☐ Can targets and indicators be measured using the existing information technology? Is collection of these indicators burdensome on provider?
The **specific considerations** involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful **starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms** in your context.

### Sample questions

- If there are performance-based financing mechanisms in place, how were indicators and targets selected? Do they describe activities or outcomes?

- Can targets and indicators be measured using the existing information technology? Is collection of these indicators burdensome on provider?

- Do providers have the appropriate supplies and infrastructure to effectively carry out their jobs?
Questions to ask to help you get started

The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ If there are performance-based financing mechanisms in place, how were indicators and targets selected? Do they describe activities or outcomes?

☐ Can targets and indicators be measured using the existing information technology? Is collection of these indicators burdensome on provider?

☐ Do providers have the appropriate supplies and infrastructure to effectively carry out their jobs?

☐ Is community engagement actively solicited? Are communities supportive of providers’ work, particularly outreach activities in communities and homes?
Questions to ask to help you get started

The specific considerations involved in planning and implementing strategies will depend on your local context.

The questions listed may be a useful starting place to determine how you might begin to plan and enact reforms in your context.

Sample questions

☐ If there are performance-based financing mechanisms in place, how were indicators and targets selected? Do they describe activities or outcomes?

☐ Can targets and indicators be measured using the existing information technology? Is collection of these indicators burdensome on provider?

☐ Do providers have the appropriate supplies and infrastructure to effectively carry out their jobs?

☐ Is community engagement actively solicited? Are communities supportive of providers’ work, particularly outreach activities in communities and homes?

☐ Do providers enjoy their jobs? Do facility managers ask providers about joy and motivation? How do they use these conversations to guide changes in service delivery or facility organization?
Recap: Provider Motivation

System
- Governance & Leadership
  - Primary Health Care Policies
  - Quality Management Infrastructure
  - Social Accountability

- Health Financing
  - Payment Systems
  - Spending on Primary Health Care
  - Financial Coverage

- Adjustment to Population Health Needs
  - Surveillance
  - Priority Setting
  - Innovation & Learning

Inputs
- Drugs & Supplies
- Facility Infrastructure
- Information Systems
- Workforce
- Funds

Population Health Management
- Local Priority Setting
- Community Engagement
- Panel Management
- Proactive Population Outreach

Facility Organization & Management
- Team-based Care Organization
- Facility Management
- Capability & Leadership
- Information Systems Use
- Performance Measurement & Management Outreach

Service Delivery
- Access
  - Financial
  - Geographic
  - Timeliness

- High Quality Primary Health Care
  - First Contact Accessibility
  - Continuity
  - Comprehensiveness
  - Coordination
  - Person-centered

Outputs
- Effective Service Coverage
  - Health Promotion
  - Disease Prevention
  - RMNCH
  - Childhood Illness
  - Infectious Disease
  - NCDs & Mental Health
  - Palliative Care

Outcomes
- Health Status
- Responsiveness to People
- Equity
- Efficiency
- Resilience of Health Systems

Social Determinants & Context (Political, Social, Demographic & Socioeconomic)
Recap: Provider Motivation

Availability of Effective PHC: The level to which providers are available, competent, and motivated to sufficiently address patients’ PHC needs.

Can a patient see a provider when needed?

Provider Motivation
- May be intrinsically or extrinsically driven, and is affected by both availability and competence.

Provider Competence
- Should be pursued during pre-service training, in-service training, and during standard supervision. Training should be specific to the skills and tasks providers are expected to provide.

Respectful and Trusting Relationships
- Patients and providers should have mutually trusting and respectful relationships that are strengthened over time.

During interactions with providers, do the patients receive appropriate care?

Suitable Workforce
- An adequately sized workforce with appropriate skill mix and equitable distribution.

Minimal Absenteeism
- That workforce is predictably onsite and available to serve patients.

Sufficient Time
- Each provider has enough time to devote to each patient’s needs.